

The Methods of Expressing Obligation and Prohibition in English, Hungarian, and Polish Statutory Instruments: Comparative Analysis of Selected Aspects of Deontic Modality

Karolina Kaczmarek, PhD

Aleksandra Matulewska, PhD

Przemysław Wiatrowski, MA

Laboratory of Legi-Linguistics

Institute of Linguistics

Faculty of Modern Languages and Literature

Adam Mickiewicz University

Poznań, Poland

Pure modal meanings

- Obligation
- Permission
- Prohibition

Obligation

- Unconditional duty which is understood here as an obligation to perform which is binding no matter the situation (actor revealed and actor not revealed)
- Conditional duty which is understood here as an obligation to perform only in specific circumstances (actor revealed and actor not revealed)
- Limited conditional duty that is to say an obligation to perform only in specific circumstances with a guaranteed minimum or maximum limit of performance where the level of performance above or below the guaranteed limit is at the actor's discretion (actor revealed and actor not revealed)

Unconditional duty with the person obliged to perform it revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Jest obowiązany ‘is obliged’</p> <p>(ii) Wymaga ‘requires’</p> <p>(iii) Powinien ‘should’</p> <p>(iv) Ma obowiązek ‘has a duty’</p> <p>(v) Należy do ‘.....’</p> <p>(vi) Present tense indicative (<i>including: obowiązek ciąży/obciąża ‘the duty burdens sb’</i>)</p> <p>(vii) Future tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + personal ending</p> <p>(ii) Köteles ‘obliged’</p> <p>(iii) Kötelesség ‘obligation’+ personal ending</p> <p>(iv) Kötelezi ‘to oblige, to impose a duty on’</p> <p>(v) Present tense indicative</p> <p>(vi) Kell ‘is needed’ + infinitive (very rare)</p>	<p>(i) Shall</p> <p>(ii) Is obliged to</p> <p>(iii) (although <i>must</i> and <i>is required to</i> are possible they are very rare)</p>

Unconditional duty with the person obliged to perform it not revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Jest wymagane ‘is required’</p> <p>(ii) Wymaga ‘requires’</p> <p>(iii) Musi ‘must’ + passive voice</p> <p>(iv) Należy + infinitive and Należy się ‘should’</p> <p>(v) Powinien ‘should’</p> <p>(v) Present tense indicative (<i>including</i> obowiązek obejmuje ‘the duty includes’)</p> <p>(vi) Future tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + infinitive</p> <p>(ii) Present tense indicative (3rd person)</p> <p>(iii) Suffix –endő/-andó</p> <p>(iv) Kötelező ‘(is) obligatory’</p> <p>(v) Kell ‘is needed’ + personal ending</p>	<p>(i) Shall</p> <p>(ii) Must</p> <p>(v) is to be done</p>

Conditional duty with the person obliged to perform it revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Jest obowiązany ‘is obliged’</p> <p>(ii) Wymaga ‘requires’</p> <p>(iii) Należy do ‘.....’</p> <p>(iv) Powinien ‘should’</p> <p>(v) Ma obowiązek ‘has a duty’</p> <p>(vi) Present tense indicative (<i>including</i>: obowiązek ciąży/obciąża ‘the duty burdens sb’, obowiązek spoczywa ‘the duty burdens sb’)</p> <p>(vii) Future tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + personal ending</p> <p>(ii) Köteles ‘obliged’</p> <p>(iii) Kötelesség ‘obligation’+ personal ending</p> <p>(iv) Kötelezi ‘to oblige, to impose a duty on’</p> <p>(v) Present tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Shall</p> <p>(ii) Must</p> <p>(iii) Is obliged to</p> <p>(iv) Is to be done by</p> <p>(v) Is required to</p>

Conditional duty with the person obliged to perform it not revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Wymaga ‘requires’ (ii) Musi ‘must’ + passive voice or Musi + infinitive mieć ‘have’ (iii) Należy ‘should’ and Należy się ‘should’ (iv) Present tense indicative <i>including</i> obowiązek obejmuje ‘the duty includes’) (v) Future tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + infinitive (ii) Present tense indicative (3rd person) (iii) Suffix –endő/-andó (vi) Kötelező ‘(is) obligatory’</p>	<p>(i) Shall (ii) Must (iii) Is to be done (iv) Is required to be done</p>

Limited conditional duty with the person obliged to perform it revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Jest obowiązany ‘is obliged’</p> <p>(ii) Wymaga ‘requires’</p> <p>(iii) Powinien ‘should’</p> <p>(iiia) Powinien spełnić obowiązek ‘should do one’s duty’</p> <p>(iv) Present tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + personal ending</p> <p>(ii) Köteles ‘obliged’</p> <p>(iii) Kötelesség ‘obligation’+ personal ending</p> <p>(iv) Kötelezi ‘to oblige, to impose a duty on’</p> <p>(v) Present tense indicative</p> <p>(vi) Kell ‘is needed’ + infinitive</p>	<p>(i) Shall</p> <p>(ii) Must</p> <p>(iii) Is required to (by done by)</p> <p>(iv) Is obliged to</p>

Limited conditional duty with the person obliged to perform it not revealed in the surface structure

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Powinno/powinien + infinitive ‘should’ (ii) Należy ‘should’ (iii) Present tense indicative	(i) Kell ‘is needed’ + infinitive (ii) Present tense indicative (3 rd person) (vi) Kötelező ‘(is) obligatory’	(i) Shall (ii) Must (iii) Is to be done (iv) Is required to be done

Pure modal sub-meanings – Prohibition (continued)

- Negation of obligation (actor revealed and not revealed)
- Negation of permission (actor revealed and not revealed)
- Sheer prohibition (actor revealed and not revealed)

Prohibition

Obligation to refrain from the action which is a situation in which the actor is required not to perform, is disallowed from performing or is not permitted to perform.

- Unlimited prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform no matter the circumstances.
- Conditional prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform only in prescribed circumstances.
- Limited conditional prohibition that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform more than X or less than X only in specific circumstances.

Prohibition

Negation of permission which is a situation in which the actor is not permitted to perform or is disallowed from performing.

- Unlimited prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform no matter the circumstances.
- Conditional prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform only in prescribed circumstances.
- Limited conditional prohibition that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform more than X or less than X only in specific circumstances.

Prohibition

Sheer prohibition

- Unlimited prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform no matter the circumstances.
- Conditional prohibition – that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform only in prescribed circumstances.
- Limited conditional prohibition that is to say a situation in which the actor is disallowed to perform more than X or less than X only in specific circumstances.

Negation of obligation – unconditional prohibition – actor revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie 'not' + powinien 'should'	(i) Nem 'not' + present tense indicative	(i) Shall not
(ii) Nie 'not' + należy 'should'		(ii) Must not (UK)
(iii) Nie 'not' + present tense indicative		
(iv) Nie 'not' + future tense indicative		

Negation of obligation – unconditional prohibition – actor not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
<p>(i) Nie ‘not’ + należy ‘should’</p> <p>(ii) Nie ‘not’ + powinien ‘should’</p> <p>(iii) Nie ‘not’ + present tense indicative (impersonal structure)</p> <p>(iv) Nie ‘not’ + future tense indicative (impersonal structure)</p>	<p>(i) Nem ‘not’ + present tense indicative</p>	<p>(i) Shall not</p> <p>(ii) Must not (UK)</p>

Negation of obligation – conditional prohibition – actor revealed and not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie 'not' + present tense indicative (ii) Nie 'not' + future tense indicative	(i) Nem 'not' + present tense indicative	(i) Shall not (ii) Must not (UK)

Negation of obligation – limited conditional prohibition – actor revealed and not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie 'not' + powinien 'should' (in personal or impersonal form respectively)	-	(i) Shall not
(ii) Nie 'not' + present tense indicative		

Negation of permission – unconditional prohibition – actor revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie może 'may not'	(i) Nem 'not' +	(i) May not
(ii) Nie jest uprawniony 'is not entitled'	suffixes -hat/ -het	(ii) Cannot (USA)
(iii) Nie ma prawa 'has no right'	(ii) Nem jogosult 'is not entitled'	
(iv) Nie wolno 'must not'		
(v) Niedopuszczalne jest (jest niedopuszczalne, nie jest dopuszczalne) 'is not admissible, is not permissible'		

Negation of permission – unconditional prohibition – actor not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie można 'may not'	(i) Nem 'not' + suffixes -hat/ -het	(i) May not (ii) Cannot (USA)
(ii) Nie wolno 'must not'	(ii) Nem szabad 'is not allowed'	
(iii) Niedopuszczalne jest (jest niedopuszczalne, nie jest dopuszczalne) 'is not admissible, is not permissible'		

Negation of permission – conditional prohibition – actor revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie może 'may not'	(i) Nem 'not' +	(i) May not
(ii) Nie ma prawa 'has no right'	suffixes -hat/ -het	(ii) Cannot (USA)
(iii) Nie wolno 'must not'	(ii) Nem jogosult 'is not entitled'	
(iv) Nie jest dopuszczalne 'is not admissible, is not permissible'		

Negation of permission – conditional prohibition – actor not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie może 'may not' and Nie można 'may not'	(i) Nem 'not' + suffixes -hat/ -het	(i) May not (ii) Cannot (USA)
(ii) Nie wolno 'must not'	(ii) Nem szabad 'is not allowed'	
(iii) Nie jest dopuszczalne 'is not admissible, is not permissible'		

Negation of permission – limited conditional prohibition – actor revealed and not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Nie może 'may not' and Nie można 'may not'	(i) Nem 'not' + suffixes -hat/ -het (ii) Nem szabad 'is not allowed'	-

Sheer prohibition – unconditional prohibition – actor not revealed

Polish	Hungarian	English
(i) Zabronione jest 'is forbidden, is prohibited'	(i) Tilos 'is forbidden, is prohibited'	(i) Is prohibited

**Thank you for
your attention**