Example: Whack-the-mole *)

A mole has burrowed a network of underground tunnels, with N openings at ground level. We are interested in modeling the sequence of openings at which the mole will poke its head out of the ground. The probability distribution of the "next" opening only depends on the present location of the mole.

Three holes:

$$X = \{x_1, x_2, x_3\}$$

modeling the movements of the mole probabilistically as a Markov chain

*) Thanks for the example to Emilio Frazolli

Transition probabilities:

$$T = \begin{bmatrix} P(x_1|x_1) & P(x_2|x_1) & P(x_3|x_1) \\ P(x_1|x_2) & P(x_2|x_2) & P(x_3|x_2) \\ P(x_1|x_3) & P(x_2|x_3) & P(x_3|x_3) \end{bmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{bmatrix} T_{1,1} & T_{1,2} & T_{1,3} \\ T_{2,1} & T_{2,2} & T_{2,3} \\ T_{3,1} & T_{3,2} & T_{3,3} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.1 & 0.4 & 0.5 \\ 0.4 & 0 & 0.6 \\ 0 & 0.6 & 0.4 \end{bmatrix}$$

Initial probabilities:

$$\pi = (\pi(1), \pi(2), \pi(3)) = ?$$

Let us assume that we know, e.g., with certainty, that the mole was at hole x_1 at time step 1 (i.e., $P(X_1 = x_1) = 1$. It takes d time units to go get the mallet. Where should I wait for the mole if I want to maximize the probability of whacking it the next time it surfaces?

 $\pi =$

Let us assume that we know, e.g., with certainty, that the mole was at hole x_1 at time step 1 (i.e., $P(X_1 = x_1) = 1$. It takes d time units to go get the mallet. Where should I wait for the mole if I want to maximize the probability of whacking it the next time it surfaces?

$$\pi = (1, 0, 0)$$

to calculate:

$$p_d = (p_d(x_1), p_d(x_2), p_d(x_3))$$

in general holds:

$$p_d(s) = \sum_{\forall s', s = succ(s')} p_{d-1}(s') * T_{s,s'}$$

in particular we can compute the individual probabilities:

$$p_{2}(x_{1}) = \sum_{s \in \{x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\}} p_{1}(s) \cdot T_{s, x_{1}}$$

$$= p_{1}(x_{1}) \cdot T_{1, 1} + p_{1}(x_{2}) \cdot T_{2, 1} + p_{1}(x_{3}) \cdot T_{3, 1}$$

$$= 1 \cdot 0.1 + 0 \cdot 0.4 + 0 \cdot 0$$

$$= 0.1$$

Example: Whack-the-mole

for the other cases:

$$p_{2}(x_{2}) = \sum_{s \in \{x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\}} p_{1}(s) \cdot T_{s, x_{2}}$$

$$= 1 \cdot 0.4 + 0 \cdot 0 + 0 \cdot 0.6$$

$$= 0.4$$

$$p_{2}(x_{3}) = \sum_{s \in \{x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\}} p_{1}(s) \cdot T_{s, x_{3}}$$

$$= 1 \cdot 0.5 + 0 \cdot 0.6 + 0 \cdot 0.4$$

$$= 0.5$$

which results in the probability distribution at timestep 2

$$p_2 = (0.1, 0.4, 0.5)$$

the computation on a more abstract level

$$p_2 = p_1 \cdot T$$

$$p_3 = p_2 \cdot T$$

$$p_4 = p_3 \cdot T$$

the distribution at the next timesteps

$$p_3 = p_2 \cdot T = (0.17, 0.34, 0.49)$$

 $p_4 = p_3 \cdot T = (0.153, 0.362, 0.485)$
...

Alternative query with little relevance for mole hunting, but high impact for practical applications (speech recognition, signal processing, machine translation, ...):

Assuming the mole surfaces every time it reaches a hole, so we can see it. What's the probability of a particular sequence of appearances $O = (x_1x_2...x_n)$, i.e. $p(x_1x_2...x_n|\mathcal{M})$?

$$p(x_1x_2...x_n|\mathcal{M}) = \pi(x_1) \cdot p(x_2|x_1) \cdot ... \cdot p(x_{n-1}|p(x_n))$$

= $\pi(x_1) \cdot \prod_{i=2}^{n} p(x_i|x_{n-1})$

which follows from the chain rule together with the Markov (independence) assumption

How likely it is that we are able to observe the mole doing a (anticyclic) round trip O = (3, 2, 1, 3)?

$$p(x_3, x_2, x_1, x_3 | \mathcal{M}) = \pi(x_3) \cdot p(x_2 | x_3) \cdot p(x_1 | x_2) \cdot p(x_3 | x_1)$$

$$= 0.485 \cdot 0.6 \cdot 0.4 \cdot 0.5$$

$$= 0.05496$$

using the approximation of the long term probability distribution $p_4=\left(0.153,0.362,0.485\right)$ from above as initial probabilities

Let us assume that every time the mole surfaces, we can hear it, but not see it (its dark outside). Our hearing is not very precise.

uncertainty of sensing \rightarrow separation of state and observation

Markov chain → Hidden Markov model

modeling the uncertainty of sensing probabilistically using additional emission/observation probabilities:

$$E = \begin{bmatrix} P(o_{1}|x_{1}) & P(o_{2}|x_{1}) & P(o_{3}|x_{1}) \\ P(o_{1}|x_{2}) & P(o_{2}|x_{2}) & P(o_{3}|x_{2}) \\ P(o_{1}|x_{3}) & P(o_{2}|x_{1}) & P(o_{3}|x_{3}) \end{bmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{bmatrix} E_{1,1} & E_{1,2} & E_{1,3} \\ E_{2,1} & E_{2,2} & E_{2,3} \\ E_{3,1} & E_{3,2} & E_{3,3} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0.6 & 0.2 & 0.2 \\ 0.2 & 0.6 & 0.2 \\ 0.2 & 0.2 & 0.6 \end{bmatrix}$$

Let us assume that over three times the mole surfaces, we make the following sequence of observations: O = (1,3,3)

Compute the distribution of the states of the mole at the end of the observation, as well as its most likely state trajectory.

state distribution:

Let us assume that over three times the mole surfaces, we make the following sequence of observations: O = (1, 3, 3)

Compute the distribution of the states of the mole at the end of the observation, as well as its most likely state trajectory.

state distribution: forward algorithm

Let us assume that over three times the mole surfaces, we make the following sequence of observations: O = (1,3,3)

Compute the distribution of the states of the mole at the end of the observation, as well as its most likely state trajectory.

state distribution: forward algorithm

most likely state sequence:

Let us assume that over three times the mole surfaces, we make the following sequence of observations: O = (1,3,3)

Compute the distribution of the states of the mole at the end of the observation, as well as its most likely state trajectory.

state distribution: forward algorithm

most likely state sequence: VITERBI algorithm

Forward algorithm:

$$p_d(s) = \alpha_d(s) = E_{s,o_d} \sum_{\forall s', s = succ(s')} p_{d-1}(s') * T_{s',s}$$

Initially:

$$p_1(s) = \alpha_1(s) = \pi(s)E_{s,o_d}$$

assuming an initial probability distribution, e.g. the long-term approximation of the Markov-chain (rounded values)

$$\pi = (0.16, 0.36, 0.48)$$

we can compute the individual probabilities:

for timestep one: $o_1 = 1$

$$p_1(x_1) = \pi(s) \cdot E_{s,o_1}$$

$$= \pi(x_1) \cdot E_{1,1}$$

$$= 0.16 \cdot 0.6$$

$$= 0.096$$

for the other states at timestep one: $o_1 = 1$

$$p_{1}(x_{2}) = \pi(s) \cdot E_{s,o_{1}}$$

$$= \pi(x_{2}) \cdot E_{2,1}$$

$$= 0.36 \cdot 0.2$$

$$= 0.072$$

$$p_{1}(x_{3}) = \pi(s) \cdot E_{s,o_{1}}$$

$$= \pi(x_{3}) \cdot E_{3,1}$$

$$= 0.48 \cdot 0.2$$

$$= 0.096$$

for timestep two:
$$o_2 = 3$$

$$\begin{aligned} p_2(x_1) &= E_{x_1,o_2} \sum_{s \in \{x_1,x_2,x_3\}} p_1(s) \cdot T_{s,x_1} \\ &= E_{1,3} \cdot (p_1(x_1) \cdot T_{1,1} + p_1(x_2) \cdot T_{2,1} + p_1(x_3) \cdot T_{3,1} \\ &= 0.2 \cdot (0.096 \cdot 0.1 + 0.072 \cdot 0.4 + 0.096 \cdot 0) \\ &= 0.00768 \\ p_2(x_2) &= E_{x_2,o_2} \sum_{s \in \{x_1,x_2,x_3\}} p_1(s) \cdot T_{s,x_2} \\ &= E_{2,3} \cdot (p_1(x_1) \cdot T_{1,2} + p_1(x_2) \cdot T_{2,2} + p_1(x_3) \cdot T_{3,2} \\ &= 0.2 \cdot (0.096 \cdot 0.4 + 0.072 \cdot 0 + 0.096 \cdot 0.6) \\ &= 0.0192 \end{aligned}$$

for timestep two (cont.):
$$o_2 = 3$$

$$p_2(x_3) = E_{x_3,o_2} \sum_{s \in \{x_1,x_2,x_3\}} p_1(s) \cdot T_{s,x_3}$$

$$= E_{3,3} \cdot (p_1(x_1) \cdot T_{1,3} + p_1(x_2) \cdot T_{2,3} + p_1(x_3) \cdot T_{3,3}$$

$$= 0.6 \cdot (0.096 \cdot 0.5 + 0.072 \cdot 0.6 + 0.096 \cdot 0.4)$$

$$= 0.07776$$

for timestep three: $o_3 = 3$

$$p_{3}(x_{1}) = E_{x_{1},o_{3}} \sum_{s \in \{x_{1},x_{2},x_{3}\}} p_{2}(s) \cdot T_{s,x_{1}}$$

$$= E_{1,3} \cdot (p_{2}(x_{1}) \cdot T_{1,1} + p_{2}(x_{2}) \cdot T_{2,1} + p_{2}(x_{3}) \cdot T_{3,1}$$

$$= 0.2 \cdot (0.00768 \cdot 0.1 + 0.00192 \cdot 0.4 + 0.07776 \cdot 0)$$

$$= 0.0003072$$

$$p_{3}(x_{2}) = E_{x_{2},o_{3}} \sum_{s \in \{x_{1},x_{2},x_{3}\}} p_{2}(s) \cdot T_{s,x_{2}}$$

$$= E_{2,3} \cdot (p_{2}(x_{1}) \cdot T_{1,2} + p_{2}(x_{2}) \cdot T_{2,2} + p_{2}(x_{3}) \cdot T_{3,2}$$

$$= 0.2 \cdot (0.00768 \cdot 0.4 + 0.00192 \cdot 0 + 0.007776 \cdot 0.6)$$

$$= 0.00154752$$

for timestep three (cont.):
$$o_3 = 3$$

$$p_3(x_3) = E_{x_3,o_3} \sum_{s \in \{x_1,x_2,x_3\}} p_2(s) \cdot T_{s,x_3}$$
$$= E_{3,3} \cdot (p_2(x_1) \cdot T_{1,3} + p_2(x_2) \cdot T_{2,3} + p_2(x_3) \cdot T_{3,3}$$
$$= 0.6 \cdot (0.00768 \cdot 0.5 + 0.0192 \cdot 0.6 + 0.07776 \cdot 0.4)$$
$$= 0.0278784$$

Evolution of the probability distribution given the observation sequence O = (1, 3, 3)

$$\pi(s) = (0.16, 0.36, 0.48)$$

$$p_1(s) = (0.096, 0.072, 0.096)$$

$$p_2(s) = (0.00768, 0.0192, 0.07776)$$

$$p_3(s) = (0.0003072, 0.00154752, 0.0278784)$$

computation on a more abstract level representing observations as sequences of one hot vectors

$$O=(o_1,o_2,...,o_n)=(\left(\begin{array}{c}0\\0\\1\end{array}\right),\left(\begin{array}{c}0\\1\\0\end{array}\right),\left(\begin{array}{c}1\\0\\0\end{array}\right),\left(\begin{array}{c}0\\0\\1\end{array}\right))$$

$$\begin{array}{lll} p_1 & = & (E \cdot o_1)^T & \circ & \pi \cdot T \\ p_2 & = & (E \cdot o_2)^T & \circ & p_1 \cdot T \\ p_3 & = & (E \cdot o_3)^T & \circ & p_2 \cdot T \\ & & & & & & & & & & & & \\ p_n & = & \underbrace{(E \cdot o_n)^T}_{\text{probability distribution}}_{\text{product of a state having product product product product product observation } _{p(o_i|x_i)}^{\text{probability distribution for the current state }} \\ p_{n-1}(x_i) \cdot p(x_j|x_i)) \end{array}$$

HADAMARD or entrywise product (here for vectors)

$$A \circ B = \begin{pmatrix} a_1 \\ a_2 \\ \cdots \\ a_n \end{pmatrix} \circ \begin{pmatrix} b_1 \\ b_2 \\ \cdots \\ b_n \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} a_1 \cdot b_1 \\ a_2 \cdot b_2 \\ \cdots \\ a_n \cdot b_n \end{pmatrix}$$

Determining the most likely state sequence $V_{\rm ITERBI}$ coefficients: maximum probability to reach a state from the start point given the observation sequence up to that point in time coefficients have to be computed for each state at each time point

observation: O = (1, 2, 3, 1)

intialization:

$$\delta_1(s) = \pi_s E_{s,o_1}$$
 $pred_1(s) = null$

1 2 3

intialization:

$$\delta_1(s) = \pi_s E_{s,o_1}$$
 $pred_1(s) = null$

1	0.0912
2	
3	

$$\delta_1(1) = \pi_1 \cdot E_{1,1}$$

$$= 0.152 \cdot 0.6$$

$$= 0.0912$$
 $pred_1(1) = null$

intialization:

$$\delta_1(s) = \pi_s E_{s,o_1}$$
 $pred_1(s) = null$

1	0.0912
2	0.0724
3	

$$\delta_1(2) = \pi_2 \cdot E_{2,1}$$
 $= 0.362 \cdot 0.2$
 $= 0.0724$
 $pred_1(2) = null$

intialization:

$$\delta_1(s) = \pi_s E_{s,o_1}$$
 $pred_1(s) = null$

1	0.0912	
2	0.0724	
3	0.097	

$$\delta_1(3) = \pi_3 \cdot E_{3,1}$$

$$= 0.485 \cdot 0.2$$

$$= 0.097$$
 $pred_1(3) = null$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$
 $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	
2	0.0724	
3	0.097	

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$

$$pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2
2	0.0724	
3	0.097	

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_2(1) &=& E_{1,2} \cdot \max_q (\delta_1(q) \cdot T_{q,1}) \\ &=& 0.2 \cdot \max \{0.0912 \cdot 0.1, 0.0724 \cdot 0.4, 0.097 \cdot 0\} \\ &=& 0.2 \cdot \max \{0.00912, 0.02896, 0\} \\ &=& 0.005712 \\ \textit{pred}_2(1) &=& 2 \end{array}$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$
 $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2
2	0.0724	0.003492 / 3
3	0.097	

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_2(2) &=& E_{2,2} \cdot \max_q (\delta_1(q) \cdot T_{q,2}) \\ &=& 0.6 \cdot \max \{0.0912 \cdot 0.4, 0.0724 \cdot 0, 0.097 \cdot 0.6\} \\ &=& 0.6 \cdot \max \{0.03648, 0, 0.0582\} \\ &=& 0.03492 \\ \textit{pred}_2(2) &=& 3 \end{array}$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$
 $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2
2	0.0724	0.003492 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_2(3) &=& E_{3,2} \cdot \max_q (\delta_1(q) \cdot T_{q,3}) \\ &=& 0.2 \cdot \max \{0.0912 \cdot 0.5, 0.0724 \cdot 0.6, 0.097 \cdot 0.4\} \\ &=& 0.2 \cdot \max \{0.0456, 0.04344, 0.0388\} \\ &=& 0.00912 \\ pred_2(3) &=& 1 \end{array}$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$
 $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \ T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$

$$pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_{3}(1) & = & E_{1,3} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_{1}(q) \cdot T_{q,1}) \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.005712 \cdot 0.1, 0.03492 \cdot 0.4, 0.0912 \cdot 0\} \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.0005712, 0.013968, 0\} \\ & = & 0.0027936 \\ pred_{3}(1) & = & 2 \end{array}$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$

$$pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_{3}(2) & = & E_{2,3} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_{1}(q) \cdot T_{q,2}) \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.005712 \cdot 0.4, 0.03492 \cdot 0, 0.0912 \cdot 0.6\} \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.0022848, 0, 0.05472\} \\ & = & 0.010944 \\ pred_{3}(2) & = & 3 \end{array}$$

recursive computation (2):

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$
 $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \ T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	0.021888 / 3

$$\delta_{3}(3) = E_{3,3} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_{1}(q) \cdot T_{q,3})$$

$$= 0.6 \cdot \max\{0.005712 \cdot 0.5, 0.03492 \cdot 0.6, 0.0912 \cdot 0.4\}$$

$$= 0.6 \cdot \max\{0.002856, 0.020952, 0.03648\}$$

$$= 0.021888$$

 $pred_3(3) = 3$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta_{k+1}(s) &= \textit{E}_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot \textit{T}_{q,s}) \\ \textit{pred}_{k+1}(s) &= \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \; \textit{T}_{q,s}) \end{aligned}$$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	0.021888 / 3

recursive computation (3): $\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max(\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$ $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2	0.00262656 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3	
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	0.021888 / 3	

$$\begin{array}{rcl} \delta_4(1) &=& E_{1,1} \cdot \max_q (\delta_1(q) \cdot T_{q,1}) \\ &=& 0.6 \cdot \max \{0.0027936 \cdot 0.1, 0.010944 \cdot 0.4, \\ && 0.021888 \cdot 0\} \\ &=& 0.6 \cdot \max \{0.0002793, 0.0043776, 0\} \\ &=& 0.00262656 \\ pred_4(1) &=& 2 \end{array}$$

recursive computation (3): $\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max(\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$ $pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2	0.00262656 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3	0.00262656 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	0.021888 / 3	

$$\delta_{4}(2) = E_{2,1} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_{1}(q) \cdot T_{q,2})$$

$$= 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.0027936 \cdot 0.4, 0.010944 \cdot 0, 0.021888 \cdot 0.6\}$$

$$= 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.00111744, 0, 0.0131328\}$$

$$= 0.00262656$$

$$pred_{4}(2) = 3$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = E_{s,o_{k+1}} \cdot \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \cdot T_{q,s})$$

$$pred_{k+1}(s) = \arg\max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$$

1	0.0912	0.005712 / 2	0.0027936 / 2	0.00262656 / 2
2	0.0714	0.003492 / 3	0.010944 / 3	0.00262656 / 3
3	0.097	0.00912 / 1	0.021888 / 3	0.00175104 / {2,3}

$$\begin{array}{lll} \delta_4(3) & = & E_{3,1} \cdot \max_q (\delta_1(q) \cdot T_{q,3}) \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.0027936 \cdot 0.5, 0.010944 \cdot 0.6, \\ & & 0.021888 \cdot 0.4\} \\ & = & 0.2 \cdot \max\{0.0013968, 0.0087552, 0.0087552\} \\ & = & 0.00175104 \\ pred_4(3) & = & \{2,3\} \end{array}$$

$$\delta_{k+1}(s) = \max_{q} \left(\delta_k(q) \ T_{q,s} \right) E_{s,o_{k+1}}$$

repeat recursively

$$\bullet \ \delta_{k+1}(s) = \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) \ T_{q,s}) \ E_{s,o_{k+1}}$$

•
$$pred_{k+1}(s) = arg \max_{q} (\delta_k(q) T_{q,s})$$

select the most likely terminal state $\hat{s}_t = \arg \max_s \delta_t(s)$

with $\hat{p} = \delta(\hat{s}_t)$ being the probability of the most likely path reconstruct the most likely path backwards:

$$\hat{q}_k = pred_{k+1}(\hat{q}_{k+1})$$

observation:

$$(x_1, x_2, x_3, x_1)$$

• two optimal final states:

$$\{s_1, s_2\}$$

• two optimal state sequences:

$$\{(s_1, s_3, s_2, s_1), (s_1, s_3, s_3, s_2)\}$$